Bert Droste-Franke • Boris P. Paal • Christian Rehtanz •
Dirk Uwe Sauer • Jens-Peter Schneider • Miranda
Schreurs • Thomas Zieseemer

Balancing Renewable Electricity

Energy Storage,
Demand Side Management,
and Network Extension
from an Interdisciplinary Perspective

In collaboration with
Ruth Klüser and Theresa Noll

Springer

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Background	1
1.2	Renewable Energies in the European Energy Mix	3
1.3	Aim and Structure of the Study	7
2	Future Perspectives of Electrical Energy Supply	9
2.1	Aims for a Long-Term Viable Development of a Renewable-Based Electricity System	9
2.1.1	Efficient Allocation and Just Distribution	10
2.1.2	An Operative Action Rule	11
2.2	Indicators for the Evaluation of Balancing Strategies	12
2.2.1	Indicators for Environmental Effects	13
2.2.2	Indicators for Resource Availability	14
2.2.3	Indicators for the Design of the Energy Supply System	16
2.3	Political Governance Towards a Renewable Energy Electricity System in Europe	17
2.3.1	Historical Background, Current Status and Development of Europe's Energy System	17
2.3.1.1	Europe's Growing Energy Dependence	17
2.3.1.2	Climate Change Constraints	18
2.3.1.3	Climate Change as a Driving Force Behind the Search for a Low-Carbon Electricity System	18
2.3.1.4	Growing Diversification of the Energy Supply	18
2.3.1.5	Trends in Renewable Energy Production in Europe	19
2.3.2	Political Governance Activities for Organising the Future Energy System	19
2.3.2.1	Regional Cooperation in Developing Renewables	19
2.3.2.2	National Actions Within the EU on Climate Change and Renewable Energy	21
2.3.2.3	European Policies for a Low-Carbon Energy Market	24
2.3.2.4	The European Energy Council of 2011	28
2.3.2.5	Moving Towards Higher Emission Reduction Targets	28

2.3.2.6 Roadmap for a Low-Carbon Economy in 2050	28
2.3.2.7 Supporting Infrastructure Development for Renewable Energy	29
2.3.2.8 Public Acceptance	29
2.3.3 Challenges Ahead	30
2.4 Economics of Storing Values	30
2.4.1 Energy Economic Background	30
2.4.2 Theory of Storing Values	32
2.4.2.1 Storing Values Without Technologies	32
2.4.2.2 Storing Values Using Technologies	33
2.5 Summary and Conclusions	35
3 Existing Energy System Studies	37
3.1 Applicability of Existing Future Energy Scenarios as Framework Conditions for the Analysis of Strategies	37
3.1.1 Energy System Modelling: A Theoretical Perspective	38
3.1.2 Basic Approaches in Energy System Analysis Followed in This Study and Data Requirements	41
3.1.3 Comparison of Relevant Energy System Analyses According to Their General Characteristics	44
3.2 The Derivation of Future Electricity Supply Parameters as Inputs for the Analysis of Balancing Strategies	49
3.2.1 Assumptions in the Political Renewable Energy Sources (RES) Scenario: Intensified Funding	51
3.2.2 Assumptions According to the Lead Scenario 2009	51
3.2.3 Effects on the Conventional Power Station Park	52
3.2.3.1 Renewable Energy Sources	52
3.2.3.2 Fuel Prices	53
3.2.3.3 Resulting Power Station Parks	55
3.2.4 Evaluation of Development Paths	56
3.3 Summary and Conclusions	58
4 Demand for Balancing Electrical Energy and Power	61
4.1 Assessing the Balancing Demand and Storage Employment Based on Scenarios for Germany	61
4.1.1 Assessing the Demand of Balancing Electrical Energy and Power	62
4.1.1.1 Effect on the Residual Load and the Available Power Station Power	62
4.1.1.2 Characteristics of Possible Wind Calms Lasting Several Days	66
4.1.1.3 Dimensioning the Necessary Storage Capacity	66
4.1.2 Estimation of the Storage Employment	70

4.2	Assessing the Storage Demand Based on an Optimised Pan-European Low-Carbon Electrical Energy Supply Strategy	73
4.2.1	General Aspects and Boundary Conditions	73
4.2.2	Power Flow Calculation	74
4.2.3	System Optimisation	76
4.2.4	Cost Data and Other Assumptions	77
4.2.5	First Model Results	79
4.2.6	Discussion of Results	79
4.3	Summary and Conclusions	81
5	Technologies for Balancing Electrical Energy and Power	83
5.1	Classification of Energy Storage Systems and Systems Offering Positive and Negative Control Power	83
5.2	Technical Description of “Electricity to Electricity” Energy Storage Technologies for a Balanced Electrical Energy and Power Supply	86
5.2.1	“Mechanical” Storage Systems for Electric Power	86
5.2.1.1	Compressed Air Energy Storage (CAES)	86
5.2.1.2	Pumped Hydropower Plants	90
5.2.1.3	Hydro Storage Systems	91
5.2.1.4	Flywheels	91
5.2.2	“Electrical” Storage Systems for Electric Power	92
5.2.2.1	Electrochemical Double-Layer Capacitors (“Supercaps”)	92
5.2.2.2	Superconducting Coils	93
5.2.3	“Chemical” Storage Systems for Electric Power	93
5.2.3.1	Lead-Acid Batteries	93
5.2.3.2	High Temperature Sodium-Based Batteries	94
5.2.3.3	Lithium-Ion Batteries	95
5.2.3.4	Nickel Cadmium (NiCd) and Nickel-Metal-Hydride (NiMH) Batteries	95
5.2.3.5	Redox-Flow Batteries	96
5.2.3.6	Hydrogen Storage Systems	97
5.3	Technical Description and Potential of “Electricity to Anything” Energy Storage Technologies for a Balanced Electrical Energy and Power Supply	99
5.3.1	DSM Industrial Sector	100
5.3.2	Balance Provision by Electrical Mobility	100
5.3.3	DSM Household Sector	101
5.3.3.1	Technical Potential of DSM in the Household Sector	101
5.3.3.2	Expected Economic Benefits from DSM in the Household Sector	105
5.3.4	Shutdown of Renewable Power Generation	108
5.3.5	Generation of Chemical Fuels such as Hydrogen, Methane or Methanol from Electricity	108

5.4	Technical Description of “Anything to Electricity” Energy Storage Technologies for a Balanced Electrical Energy and Power Supply	109
5.4.1	CHP Plants with Thermal Storage	109
5.4.2	Conventional Power Plants Using Fossil, Nuclear, Hydro or Biofuels	113
5.5	Conclusions on Options for Demand Response and Demand-Side Management	113
5.6	Life Cycle Cost Analysis of Storage Technologies	114
5.7	Assessment of Future Viability of the Technologies’ Environmental Issues, Resource Use and System Characteristics ...	119
5.7.1	Methodology and Data Applied for Quantitative Assessment	120
5.7.2	Environmental Impacts	120
5.7.2.1	Assessment Methodology and Assumptions	120
5.7.2.2	Environmental External Costs of Balancing Technologies	123
5.7.2.3	Environmental Impacts of Balancing Technologies Differentiated into Categories	126
5.7.3	Resource Use	128
5.7.3.1	Types and Amounts of Resources Required	128
5.7.3.2	Current Availability of Relevant Mineral Resources	129
5.7.3.3	Resource Potentials for the Production of Balancing Technologies	131
5.7.4	System Characteristics Relevant for Society	134
5.7.4.1	Supply Reliability	135
5.7.4.2	Risk Avoidance	137
5.7.4.3	Openness to Options	137
5.7.5	Conclusions on the Future Viability of Various Approaches to Energy Storage	138
5.8	Summary and Conclusions	138
6	Technology of Electricity Networks and Economical Impacts	143
6.1	Assessment of Technical Barriers Considering the Total System Including Network Requirements	143
6.1.1	Interaction of Load Control with the Distribution Network	143
6.1.2	Transmission Network Expansion	149
6.2	Economical Impacts of Balancing Activities at the Daily and Seasonal Scales	154
6.2.1	Distribution Network Requirements for Avoiding Restrictions	154
6.2.2	Effects of the Transmission Network Expansion Measures	158

6.2.3	Conclusions on Economical Impacts of Balancing Activities	160
6.3	Summary and Conclusions	160
7	Economic Analysis and Policy	163
7.1	Problems in a Market Economy without Economic Policy: Weather-Based Supply and Culturally Caused Demand Fluctuations	163
7.1.1	The Insurance Function of the Market	163
7.1.2	Fluctuations and Smoothing of Electricity Demand: Energy Saving Reduces the Demand for Storage Facilities	164
7.1.3	Fluctuations and Smoothing of Supply	166
7.1.4	Coordination of Supply and Demand	166
7.1.5	Aspects of Long-Run Developments	167
7.1.6	Towards a Theory of Location for Storage Facilities	168
7.2	Analysis of Economic Framework Conditions	169
7.2.1	Introduction: The Theory of Economic Policy	169
7.2.2	The Theory of Economic Policy in the Area of Environmental and Technology Problems	170
7.2.2.1	Tradable CO ₂ Permits, Taxes and Other Instruments	170
7.2.2.2	Research and Technical Progress: Trusting Markets Only Versus Support for Complementary Technologies?	171
7.2.2.3	Beyond Pigovian Corrections	172
7.2.2.4	Policies for Imported Resources and Political Risks	172
7.2.3	The Current Practice of Government Support	172
7.2.4	Stylised Views on Economic Policy: First Best, Second Best, History and Transition	173
7.2.4.1	First Best	173
7.2.4.2	Second Best	174
7.2.4.3	Historical Heritage	175
7.2.4.4	Transition to Science Based Views	175
7.2.5	Economic Policy Recommendations	176
7.3	Summary and Conclusions	177
8	Legal Analysis of Balancing Strategies	179
8.1	Introductory Remarks	179
8.2	Energy Storage	180
8.2.1	Centralised Storage Systems	180
8.2.1.1	Planning and Licensing	180
8.2.1.2	Regulatory Incentives	181
8.2.1.3	Access	181
8.2.1.4	Unbundling	184

8.2.2 Decentralised Storage Systems, Especially E-mobility	185
8.2.2.1 Legal Relationships	185
8.2.2.2 Contractual Relationships Within Networks	187
8.2.2.3 Questions Concerning Data Protection	189
8.3 Balancing Strategies in Distribution Grids	190
8.3.1 Smart Meter	190
8.3.1.1 Topics Regarding Data Protection	191
8.3.1.2 Contractual Relationships in Networks	195
8.3.2 Smart Grid/Demand-Side Management	195
8.3.2.1 Data Protection	196
8.3.2.2 Contractual Relationships in Networks	196
8.4 Transmission Network Expansion	196
8.4.1 The Status Quo for Planning and Licensing of Network Expansion	197
8.4.2 The Status Quo of Investment Regulation as Part of Economic Energy Regulation	200
8.4.2.1 Unbundling	201
8.4.2.2 Network Investment Duties for TSOs	201
8.4.2.3 Investment Planning Duties of TSOs as an Instrument of Reflexive Steering	203
8.4.2.4 Investment Incentives and Securing Investments as an Aspect of Price Regulation	205
8.4.3 Concepts for a Reform of Planning, Licensing and Regulating of Network Expansion	207
8.4.3.1 National Concepts	207
8.4.3.2 European Concepts	209
8.4.4 Summary and Conclusions	211
9 Conclusions and Recommendations	213
9.1 Overall Aim and Results	213
9.2 Challenges and Recommendations	214
9.2.1 Development of Technical Infrastructure	215
9.2.2 Framework Conditions and Organisational Aspects	217
9.2.2.1 Market Conditions for Balancing Technologies	217
9.2.2.2 Specific Support for the Application of Balancing Technologies	220
References	223
Glossary	233
List of Authors	241
Appendix	245
Further volumes of the series Ethics of Science and Technology Assessment (Wissenschaftsethik und Technikfolgenbeurteilung)	251