HYDROGEN IN TYPE Ic SUPERNOVAE?

David Branch¹, David J. Jeffery¹, Timothy R. Young², & E. Baron¹

ABSTRACT

By definition, a Type Ic supernova (SN Ic) does not have conspicuous lines of hydrogen or helium in its optical spectrum. SNe Ic usually are modelled in terms of the gravitational collapse of bare carbon–oxygen cores. We consider the possibility that the spectra of ordinary (SN 1994I–like) SNe Ic have been misinterpreted, and that SNe Ic eject hydrogen. An absorption feature usually attributed to a blend of Si II λ6355 and C II λ6580 may be produced by Hα. If SN 1994I–like SNe Ic eject hydrogen, the possibility that hypernova (SN 1998bw–like) SNe Ic, some of which are associated with gamma–ray bursts, also eject hydrogen should be considered. The implications of hydrogen for SN Ic progenitors and explosion models are briefly discussed.

Subject headings: supernovae: general — supernovae: individual (SN 1994I, SN 1999ex)

1. INTRODUCTION

A Type II supernova (SN II) has conspicuous hydrogen lines in its optical spectrum. A Type Ib supernova lacks conspicuous hydrogen lines but does have conspicuous He I lines. A Type Ic supernova has conspicuous lines of neither hydrogen nor He I. For a review of supernova spectral classification see Filippenko (1997).

Supernovae of these types are thought to result from core–collapse in massive stars. A SN Ib is hydrogen–deficient in its outer layers, and displays He I lines owing to nonthermal excitation by the decay products of radioactive ⁵⁶Ni and ⁵⁶Co (Lucy 1991). In recent years it has becomes clear that at least some SNe Ib are not completely hydrogen–free; in fact, it is likely that most or even all SNe Ib eject a small amount of hydrogen at high velocities (Deng et al. 2000; Branch et al. 2002; Elmhamdi et al. 2006). If some of the events

¹Homer L. Dodge Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Oklahoma, Norman, OK 73019; e-mail: branch@nhn.ou.edu

²Department of Physics, University of North Dakota, Grand Forks, ND, 58202
classified as Type Ib had been observed earlier, hydrogen lines might have been conspicuous, in which case they would be classified as Type IIb — the designation used for events such as SN 1993J that looked like a Type II at early times but later looked like a Type Ib (Filippenko, Matheson, & Ho 1993).

A SN Ic either is helium–deficient in its outer layers or fails to nonthermally excite its helium (Woosley & Eastman 1997). It has become common practice to model SNe Ic in terms of core collapse in bare (or nearly bare) carbon–oxygen cores (Iwamoto et al. 1994; Foley et al. 2003; Mazzali et al. 2004).

Supernova spectral features are P–Cygni features characterized by line–centered emission components and blueshifted absorption components, with the absorptions frequently being more identifiable. Spectral features usually are blended owing to the huge Doppler broadening. Nevertheless, some identifications of spectral lines are definite. For example, blends of Fe II lines and features produced by Ca II H&K and the Ca II infrared triplet appear in all types of supernovae as long as the temperature is sufficiently low. However, there also are some serious identification ambiguities. The most well known involves the Na I D–line doublet at mean wavelength $\lambda 5892$ and the strongest optical line of He I, $\lambda 5876$, which are separated by only about 800 km s$^{-1}$. If the corresponding observed feature is strong and other He I lines are not present, the feature is produced at least mainly by Na I, while if other He I lines are clearly present then the feature is at least partly due to He I. But if the observed feature is not strong, it can be difficult to choose between Na I and He I.

When SNe Ic are interpreted in terms of bare carbon–oxygen cores, an absorption feature usually near 6200 Å, which we will refer to as the 6200 Å absorption, is attributed to the strongest optical line of Si II, $\lambda 6355$ (the transition definitely responsible for the similarly located deep absorption in Type Ia supernovae), perhaps blended with the strongest optical line of C II, $\lambda 6580$, forming in higher–velocity ejecta than Si II. Local–thermodynamic–equilibrium (LTE) calculations of Sobolev line optical depths for a composition dominated by carbon and oxygen (with hydrogen and helium burned to carbon and oxygen, and solar mass fractions of heavier elements) show that within certain intervals of temperature Si II $\lambda 6355$ and C II $\lambda 6580$ are expected to have significant optical depths (Hatano et al. 1999). Nevertheless, the identification of the 6200 Å absorption is plagued by ambiguities. The strongest line of Ne I, $\lambda 6402$, is about 2200 km s$^{-1}$ to the red of Si II $\lambda 6355$, and H$\alpha$ $\lambda 6563$ is only about 800 km s$^{-1}$ to the blue of C II $\lambda 6580$. Because these four ions, each of which could appear in supernova spectra (although Ne I probably would require nonthermal excitation), have their strongest optical lines to the red, but not too far to the red, of the 6200 Å absorption, the ambiguity is difficult to resolve when the observed feature is weak and other lines of these ions do not produce identifiable features.
In this paper we are primarily concerned with the possible presence of hydrogen in SNe Ic. This issue (and that of helium in SNe Ic) has been addressed in the literature before; for summaries see Filippenko (1997); Matheson et al. (2001); and Branch (2002). The presence of hydrogen has been suggested, for example, by Filippenko (1988, 1992); Filippenko, Porter, & Sargent (1990); Jeffery et al. (1991); and Branch (2002). The currently prevailing view, however, is that hydrogen is absent and the 6200 Å absorption is produced by Si II and/or C II (Wheeler et al. 1994; Millard et al. 1999). In §2, based on a comparison of spectra of the Type Ib or Type Ib/c SN 1999ex, which we believe to contain hydrogen, and the Type Ic SN 1994I, we raise the question of whether hydrogen also is present in SN 1994I. In §3, comparisons of spectra of SN 1999ex and SN 1994I with synthetic spectra generated with the parameterized resonant–scattering code Synow are presented and discussed. In §4, the implications of the presence of hydrogen in ordinary (SN 1994I–like), and possibly even in hypernova (SN 1998bw–like; Foley et al. 2003) SNe Ic, are briefly considered.

2. COMPARISON OF SN 1999ex AND SN 1994I

SN 1999ex was initially classified as Type Ic based on a resemblance of its early spectrum to SN 1994I (Hamuy & Phillips 1999), but because it later developed He I lines Hamuy et al. (2002) revised the classification to intermediate Type Ib/c. Although the He I lines were not as deep as in most events that have been classified as Type Ib, their presence was definite, so Branch (2002) referred to SN 1999ex as a “shallow–helium” Type Ib. Hamuy et al. (2002) labelled the 6200 Å absorption as Si II, but Branch (2002) argued that the correct identification is Hα, consistent with the presence of Hα in most if not all other SNe Ib. Recently Elmhamdi et al. (2006) have reinforced the conclusion that SNe Ib, including SN 1999ex and another transition Type Ib/c event, SN 1996aq, eject hydrogen. (The overluminous Type Ib SN 1991D (Benetti et al. 2002) could be an exception.)

The spectra of SN 1999ex and the Type Ic SN 1994I shown in Figures 1 to 3 are from Hamuy et al. (2002) and Filippenko et al. (1995), respectively. The horizontal scale on all figures in this paper is logarithmic wavelength, which allows the widths of Doppler–broadened features to be compared on an equal basis across the whole spectrum. The spectra are “tilted” by multiplying by λ^n, with α chosen to make the flux peaks near 4600 Å and 6300 Å about equally high. The tilting makes it easier to compare spectral features. When comparing SN 1999ex and SN 1994I spectra we artificially blueshift those of SN 1999ex in order to compensate for the different photospheric velocities and roughly align the absorption features.

In Figure 1 a spectrum of SN 1994I obtained 2 days before the time of maximum light
in the $B$ band (day $-2$) is compared with a day $-1$ spectrum of SN 1999ex that has been blueshifted by 4000 km s$^{-1}$. Figure 2 is like Figure 1, but for day $+4$ spectra of SN 1994I and SN 1999ex, with the latter blueshifted by 2000 km s$^{-1}$. Figure 3 is for a day $+10$ spectrum of SN 1994I and a day $+13$ spectrum of SN 1999ex, with the latter blueshifted by 2000 km s$^{-1}$. In all three figures the spectra are similar in many respects, although the features are more washed out in SN 1994I because of its higher photospheric velocity at each epoch (hence the necessity to blueshift SN 1999ex to illustrate the similarities). Otherwise the main differences are that He I $\lambda 6678$ and $\lambda 7065$, although weak, are clearly present in SN 1999ex (making it a Type Ib or at least a Type Ib/c), but they are not clearly present in SN 1994I (making it a Type Ic). However, it is not possible on the basis of Figures 1 to 3 to exclude the presence of weak He I features in SN 1994I. Given the similarities in these figures — and they are rather striking — the question becomes: are the Na I and Si II/C II identifications correct for SN 1994I? If so, then the resemblance of the SN 1999ex and SN 1994I spectra from about 5500 Å to 6300 Å is coincidental.

3. COMPARISONS WITH SYNTHETIC SPECTRA

To further investigate the possibility of hydrogen (and He I) in SN 1994I we have used the parameterized resonant–scattering Synow code (Branch et al. 2002) to generate synthetic spectra for comparison with spectra of SN 1999ex and SN 1994I.

3.1. SN 1999ex

In Figure 4 the day $+4$ spectrum of SN 1999ex is compared with a synthetic spectrum in which the 6200 Å absorption is produced by H$\alpha$. In the synthetic spectrum the velocity at the photosphere is 8000 km s$^{-1}$. Hydrogen is detached from the photosphere at 13,000 km s$^{-1}$ where H$\alpha$ has an optical depth of 0.5. Hydrogen–line optical depths decrease outward exponentially but very slowly, with e–folding velocity $v_e = 20,000$ km s$^{-1}$, to an imposed maximum velocity of 20,000 km s$^{-1}$. Given the closeness of the fit to the 6200 Å absorption, we know that with fine adjustments of the optical–depth profile we could refine the fit to be practically perfect. Thus at the Synow level of analysis, H$\alpha$ is completely adequate and we would not prefer a different identification without other evidence. For all ions used in Figure 4, reference–line optical depths and $v_e$ values (in units of 1000 km s$^{-1}$) are given in Table 1.

Elmhamdi et al. (2006) show that Si II $\lambda 6355$ cannot account for the 6200 Å absorption
of SN 1999ex on its own because even when it is undetached from the photosphere, its synthetic absorption feature is too blue. It is unlikely that the 6200 Å absorption is due mainly to Ne I λ6402 because the observed feature is strong enough that when it is fitted with Ne I λ6402 other Ne I lines appear in the synthetic spectrum and the fit deteriorates. This conclusion is based on LTE excitation and must be tested against detailed non-LTE calculations that take nonthermal excitation into account.

Hamuy et al. (2002) also obtained a day +4 spectrum of SN 1999ex that extends to nearly 2.5 microns. Synow fitting parameters used to fit the optical He I lines also give satisfactory fits to features attributed to He I λ10830 and He I λ20851 (Branch 2002; Elmhamdi et al. 2006), but the infrared spectrum does not provide a useful constraint on the presence of hydrogen.

3.2. SN 1994I

Synow fits to spectra of SN 1994I in which the 6200 Å absorption is attributed to Si II and/or detached high–velocity C II are shown in Millard et al. (1999) and Elmhamdi et al. (2006). For this paper we began trying to fit the day +4 spectrum of SN 1994I by varying the input parameters that were used for the synthetic spectrum shown in Figure 4 for SN 1999ex, i.e., we assumed the presence of hydrogen and He I lines. Figure 5 for SN 1994I is like Figure 4 for SN 1999ex. The synthetic spectrum has a velocity at the photosphere of 11,000 km s\(^{-1}\) (compared with 8000 km s\(^{-1}\) for SN 1999ex). Hydrogen lines are detached from the photosphere at 15,000 km s\(^{-1}\) where Hα has an optical depth of 0.4. Hydrogen–line optical depths decrease outward exponentially with e–folding velocity \(v_e = 20,000\) km s\(^{-1}\) to an imposed maximum velocity of 22,000 km s\(^{-1}\). This hydrogen optical–depth profile is quite similar to that used for SN 1999ex in Figure 4, and in Figure 5 the 6200 Å absorption is fit nicely. The 5700 Å absorption also is fit nicely by He I λ5876. In the synthetic spectrum He I λ6678 and λ7065 are weak and rather washed out owing to the high photospheric velocity, but they do more good than harm and their presence in the observed spectrum cannot be excluded. (However, regarding the strong observed absorption near one micron, the situation remains as illustrated and discussed in Millard et al. (1999); the synthetic He I λ10830 absorption is too weak and narrow to account entirely for the observed absorption.) Reference–line optical depths and \(v_e\) values for Figure 5 are given in Table 1.

The synthetic spectrum in Figure 6 is like that of Figure 5 except that it includes Si II lines instead of hydrogen lines. The figure illustrates that in SN 1994I, as well as in SN 1999ex, Si II λ6355 is too blue to account for the 6200 Å absorption on its own (flux differences between observed and Synow spectra are to be expected, but differences in wave-
lengths of absorption features are regarded as serious discrepancies), although it is possible to obtain a fit by invoking detached high–velocity C II. Because the 6200 Å absorption is less deep in SN 1994I than in SN 1999ex, and the SN 1994I features are more smeared out by the higher photospheric velocity, it also is difficult to exclude Ne I λ6402 in SN 1994I.

4. DISCUSSION

4.1. Spectroscopy

We have discussed the possibility of Hα in absorption, in the spectrum of the Type Ic SN 1994I. As shown in Figure 7, this is an issue for SNe Ic in general; the spectra within the wavelength interval emphasized in this paper have strong similarities. Other evidence for hydrogen in SNe Ic was emphasized by Filippenko (1988; 1992): the apparent presence of broad Hα emission in near–maximum–light spectra. This feature can be seen in the day –2 spectrum of SN 1994I in Figure 1 (beneath a narrow Hα emission due to an H II region). In order to produce a peaked rather than a flat Hα emission component the hydrogen would have to be present down to the photosphere, rather than being confined to a detached high–velocity shell such as we have invoked for the absorption component. In this regard it is interesting to note that in Figures 1 to 3 the red edges of the putative Hα and He I λ5876 absorptions in SN 1994I are less sharp than in SN 1999ex; a detached shell produces sharp red edges. A continuous Hα optical–depth distribution that peaks at 15,000 km s$^{-1}$ but extends down to the photosphere might suffice to produce a peaked Hα emission. This can only be tested by non-LTE calculations because the resonance–scattering approximation on which Synow is based is known to be a poor approximation for Hα in SNe II. It is not clear that a large hydrogen mass would be required because the appearance of hydrogen and He I lines depends on the radial optical–depth profiles (Branch et al. 2002) and on the distribution of $^{56}$Ni (Woosley & Eastman 1997).

At present it is difficult to establish the presence or absence of hydrogen in SN 1994I–like SNe Ic, but the issue should be considered further. A large–scale comparative study of observed spectra, like that of Elmhamdi et al. (2006) but including SNe Ic as well as SNe Ib, probably would yield clues. In addition, detailed non-LTE spectrum calculations for a grid of explosion models are needed. Such calculations, even based on parameterized explosion models rather than full hydrodynamical calculations, could probe several issues:

---

$^{1}$Filippenko (1988) referred to the events suggested to have hydrogen as Type Ib because the Type Ic classification (Wheeler & Harkness 1986) was not yet commonly used, but these events are now classified Type Ic.
e.g., is Ne I λ6402 really a candidate to produce the 6200 Å absorption, and under what circumstances can peaked Hα emission be produced? In the only full non-LTE calculations for SNe Ic published so far (Baron et al. 1999), synthetic spectra for models containing no hydrogen did not provide good fits to the 6200 Å absorption in SN 1994I.

An interesting recent case is that of SN 2005bf (Anupama et al. 2005; Tominaga et al. 2005; Folatelli et al. 2006), which like SN 1999ex was initially classified as Type Ic but later developed definite He I lines, making it either Type Ib or Type Ib/c (or Type Icb?). In each of these three papers the 6200 Å absorption was attributed to Hα. Strong support for the identification was provided by the presence in early spectra of Ca II and Fe II at the same high velocity (15,000 km s\(^{-1}\)) as the Hα absorption (Folatelli et al. 2006). The very long rise time to maximum light of 40 days indicates that the progenitor was massive. In addition, SN 2005bf showed evidence for high–velocity polar ejection, reminiscent of SN 1998bw–like explosions of massive stars, some of which produce gamma–ray–bursts (GRBs). In view of the high ejected mass and the polar ejection, Folatelli et al. suggested that SN 2005bf may have been a transition event between ordinary SNe Ib/c and hypernovae. Therefore if SN 2005bf ejected hydrogen we should consider the possibility that SN 1998bw–like SNe Ic also do.

In SN 1998bw–like spectra the 5700 Å absorption and the 6200 Å absorption are assumed to be Na I and Si II, respectively. These identifications initially were adopted (Iwamoto et al. 1998; Branch 2001) partly because they were assumed to be correct for SN 1994I, and SN 1998bw–like spectra were and still are regarded to be Doppler–broadened versions of SN 1994I–like spectra, and partly because Monte Carlo spectrum calculations for bare carbon–oxygen cores do provide reasonable fits to SN 1998bw–like spectra (e.g., Mazzali, Iwamoto, & Nomoto 2000, Mazzali et al. 2002) with Si II and/or C II producing the 6200 Å absorption. Thus, even if the 6200 Å absorption in SN 1994I–like SNe Ic is produced by Hα, it may still turn out to be produced by Si II in SN 1998bw–likes. Nevertheless, the possibility that even in SN 1998bw–likes the correct identification is Hα rather than Si II (and perhaps He I rather than Na I) should be considered. Full non–LTE spectrum calculations for comparison with SN 1998bw–like spectra are in their initial stages (E. Baron & M. Troxel, in preparation).

4.2. Implications for Progenitors and Explosion Models

Ideas concerning the progenitors of SNe Ib and SN 1994I–like SNe Ic have been reviewed by Podsiadlowski (1996), who concluded that most of the progenitors are stars of main–sequence masses \(\lesssim 20\) solar masses that lose their envelopes by means of binary interactions.
In standard binary evolutionary scenarios, if all or even just a substantial fraction the helium envelope must be lost, all of the hydrogen is lost. For example, Nomoto et al. (1994) favored a scenario involving two common–envelope episodes that results in a carbon–oxygen core containing little or no helium and no hydrogen. However, as emphasized by Podsiadlowski, there are many unresolved questions in binary stellar evolution. If SN 1994I–like SNe Ic eject hydrogen (and therefore also, of course, helium), some modification of the standard evolutionary scenarios, perhaps involving substantial mixing of hydrogen prior to and/or during the explosion, will be needed.

SN 1998bw–like SNe Ic, including those that produce GRBs, are usually regarded to come from stars of sufficiently high main–sequence mass that they can lose their envelopes by means of single–star winds. Those that produce GRBs may have to be in binaries in order to have sufficient angular momentum at the time of core–collapse for the collapsar model (McFadyen & Woosley 1999) to be viable (Fryer & Heger 2005; Petrovic et al. 2005). The uncertainties involved in the evolutionary scenarios for SN 1998bw–likes are even greater than for SN 1994I–likes, and if SN 1998bw–likes eject hydrogen, current scenarios will require revision. Particularly interesting in this regard are recent results on chemically homogeneous evolution of rapidly rotating massive stars (Yoon & Langer 2005; Woosley & Heger 2006). Some of these GRB–candidate models contain hydrogen at the time of core collapse.

We are grateful to Mario Hamuy, Alex Filippenko, and Tom Matheson for providing spectra, to Filippenko, Alicia Soderberg, and the anonymous referee for helpful comments on the manuscript, and to Norbert Langer for calling our attention to recent results on quasi–homogeneous evolution of rapidly rotating massive stars. This work has been supported by NSF grants AST-0204771 and AST-0506028, NASA LTSA grant NNG04GD36G, and NASA ADP grant NAG5-3505.
REFERENCES


Filippenko, A. V. 1997, ARAA, 35, 309


Hamuy, M., & Phillips, M. M. 1999, IAU Circ. 7310


This preprint was prepared with the AAS L\TeX macros v5.2.
Fig. 1.— A day $-2$ spectrum of the Type Ic SN 1994I is compared with a day $-1$ spectrum of the Type Ib or Type Ib/c SN 1999ex. The latter is blueshifted by 4000 km s$^{-1}$ to align the absorption features. The flux scale is arbitrary and the spectra have been tilted to facilitate the comparison of spectral features. The narrow absorptions near 5900 Å in SN 1994I and 5800 Å in SN 1999ex are interstellar Na I in the host galaxies and the narrow absorptions near 6700 Å and 7400 Å in SN 1999ex are telluric.
Fig. 2.— Like Figure 1 but for day +4 spectra of both SN 1994I and SN 1999ex. The latter is blueshifted by 2000 km s$^{-1}$.
Fig. 3.— Like Figure 1 but for a day +10 spectrum of SN 1994I and a day +13 spectrum of SN 1999ex. The latter is blueshifted by 2000 km s$^{-1}$. 
Fig. 4.— The day +4 spectrum of SN 1999ex (solid line) is compared to a Synow synthetic spectrum (dashed line) that has $v_{\text{phot}} = 8000$ km s$^{-1}$ and includes lines of hydrogen, He I, O I, Mg II, Ca II, and Fe II.
Fig. 5.— The day +4 spectrum of SN 1994I (solid line) is compared to a Synow synthetic spectrum (dashed line) that has $v_{\text{phot}} = 11,000$ km s$^{-1}$ and includes lines of hydrogen, He I, O I, Mg II, Ca II, Fe II, and Ti II.
Fig. 6.— Like Figure 5 except that the synthetic spectrum includes lines of Si II instead of hydrogen.
Fig. 7.— A day +10 spectrum of SN 1994I is compared with spectra of four other SNe Ic (from Matheson et al. 2001). The flux scale is arbitrary and the spectra have been tilted to facilitate the comparison of spectral features. The spectrum of SN 1990B was obtained on day +5. The spectra of SN 1988L, SN 1995F, and SN 1997ei were obtained 11, 10, and 6 days after discovery, respectively; the dates of $B$ maximum are unknown.
Table 1. **Synow** Fitting Parameters for Figures 4 and 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>$\lambda_{\text{ref}}$</th>
<th>$\tau$</th>
<th>$v_e$</th>
<th>$\tau$</th>
<th>$v_e$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fig. 4</td>
<td>Fig. 4</td>
<td>Fig. 5</td>
<td>Fig. 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H$\alpha$</td>
<td>$\lambda 6563$</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>He I</td>
<td>$\lambda 5876$</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O I</td>
<td>$\lambda 7773$</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mg II</td>
<td>$\lambda 4481$</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ca II</td>
<td>$\lambda 3934$</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ti II</td>
<td>$\lambda 4550$</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe II</td>
<td>$\lambda 5018$</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>